

GCE

History A

Y304/01: Thematic study and historical interpretations: The church and medieval heresy c.1100-1437

A Level

Mark Scheme for June 2024

OCR (Oxford Cambridge and RSA) is a leading UK awarding body, providing a wide range of qualifications to meet the needs of candidates of all ages and abilities. OCR qualifications include AS/A Levels, Diplomas, GCSEs, Cambridge Nationals, Cambridge Technicals, Functional Skills, Key Skills, Entry Level qualifications, NVQs and vocational qualifications in areas such as IT, business, languages, teaching/training, administration and secretarial skills.

It is also responsible for developing new specifications to meet national requirements and the needs of students and teachers. OCR is a not-for-profit organisation; any surplus made is invested back into the establishment to help towards the development of qualifications and support, which keep pace with the changing needs of today's society.

This mark scheme is published as an aid to teachers and students, to indicate the requirements of the examination. It shows the basis on which marks were awarded by examiners. It does not indicate the details of the discussions which took place at an examiners' meeting before marking commenced.

All examiners are instructed that alternative correct answers and unexpected approaches in candidates' scripts must be given marks that fairly reflect the relevant knowledge and skills demonstrated.

Mark schemes should be read in conjunction with the published question papers and the report on the examination.

© OCR 2024

MARKING INSTRUCTIONS

PREPARATION FOR MARKING

RM ASSESSOR

1. Make sure that you have accessed and completed the relevant training packages for on-screen marking: *RM Assessor Assessor Online Training*; *OCR Essential Guide to Marking*.
2. Make sure that you have read and understood the mark scheme and the question paper for this unit. These are posted on the RM Cambridge Assessment Support Portal <http://www.rm.com/support/ca>
3. Log-in to RM Assessor and mark the **required number** of practice responses (“scripts”) and the **number of required** standardisation responses.

YOU MUST MARK 5 PRACTICE AND 6 STANDARDISATION RESPONSES BEFORE YOU CAN BE APPROVED TO MARK LIVE SCRIPTS.

MARKING

1. Mark strictly to the mark scheme.
2. Marks awarded must relate directly to the marking criteria.
3. The schedule of dates is very important. It is essential that you meet the RM Assessor 50% and 100% (traditional 40% Batch 1 and 100% Batch 2) deadlines. If you experience problems, you must contact your Team Leader (Supervisor) without delay.
4. If you are in any doubt about applying the mark scheme, consult your Team Leader by telephone or the RM Assessor messaging system, or by email.
5. **Crossed Out Responses**
Where a candidate has crossed out a response and provided a clear alternative then the crossed out response is not marked. Where no alternative response has been provided, examiners may give candidates the benefit of the doubt and mark the crossed out response where legible.

Rubric Error Responses – Optional Questions

Where candidates have a choice of question across a whole paper or a whole section and have provided more answers than required, then all responses are marked and the highest mark allowable within the rubric is given. Enter a mark for each question answered into RM assessor, which will select the highest mark from those awarded. (*The underlying assumption is that the candidate has penalised themselves by attempting more questions than necessary in the time allowed.*)

Multiple Choice Question Responses

When a multiple choice question has only a single, correct response and a candidate provides two responses (even if one of these responses is correct), then no mark should be awarded (as it is not possible to determine which was the first response selected by the candidate).

When a question requires candidates to select more than one option/multiple options, then local marking arrangements need to ensure consistency of approach.

Contradictory Responses

When a candidate provides contradictory responses, then no mark should be awarded, even if one of the answers is correct.

Short Answer Questions (requiring only a list by way of a response, usually worth only **one mark per response**)

Where candidates are required to provide a set number of short answer responses then only the set number of responses should be marked. The response space should be marked from left to right on each line and then line by line until the required number of responses have been considered. The remaining responses should not then be marked. Examiners will have to apply judgement as to whether a 'second response' on a line is a development of the 'first response', rather than a separate, discrete response. *(The underlying assumption is that the candidate is attempting to hedge their bets and therefore getting undue benefit rather than engaging with the question and giving the most relevant/correct responses.)*

Short Answer Questions (requiring a more developed response, worth **two or more marks**)

If the candidates are required to provide a description of, say, three items or factors and four items or factors are provided, then mark on a similar basis – that is downwards (as it is unlikely in this situation that a candidate will provide more than one response in each section of the response space.)

Longer Answer Questions (requiring a developed response)

Where candidates have provided two (or more) responses to a medium or high tariff question which only required a single (developed) response and not crossed out the first response, then only the first response should be marked. Examiners will need to apply professional judgement as to whether the second (or a subsequent) response is a 'new start' or simply a poorly expressed continuation of the first response.

6. Always check the pages (and additional objects if present) at the end of the response in case any answers have been continued there. If the candidate has continued an answer there, then add a tick to confirm that the work has been seen.
7. Award No Response (NR) if:
 - there is nothing written in the answer space

Award Zero '0' if:

- anything is written in the answer space and is not worthy of credit (this includes text and symbols).

Team Leaders must confirm the correct use of the NR button with their markers before live marking commences and should check this when reviewing scripts.

8. The RM Assessor **comments box** is used by your team leader to explain the marking of the practice responses. Please refer to these comments when checking your practice responses. **Do not use the comments box for any other reason.**
If you have any questions or comments for your team leader, use the phone, the RM Assessor messaging system, or e-mail.
9. Assistant Examiners will send a brief report on the performance of candidates to their Team Leader (Supervisor) via email by the end of the marking period. The report should contain notes on particular strengths displayed as well as common errors or weaknesses. Constructive criticism of the question paper/mark scheme is also appreciated.
10. For answers marked by levels of response:
 - a. **To determine the level** – start at the highest level and work down until you reach the level that matches the answer
 - b. **To determine the mark within the level**, consider the following

| Descriptor | Award mark |
|---|---|
| On the borderline of this level and the one below | At bottom of level |
| Just enough achievement on balance for this level | Above bottom and either below middle or at middle of level (depending on number of marks available) |
| Meets the criteria but with some slight inconsistency | Above middle and either below top of level or at middle of level (depending on number of marks available) |
| Consistently meets the criteria for this level | At top of level |

11. Annotations

| Annotation | Meaning |
|---|--|
|  | Blank Page |
| | Highlight |
| Off-page comment | |
|  | Assertion |
|  | Analysis |
|  | Evaluation |
|  | Explanation |
|  | Factor |
|  | Illustrates/Describes |
|  | Irrelevant, a significant amount of material that does not answer the question |
|  | Judgement |
|  | Knowledge and understanding |
|  | Provenance |
|  | Simple comment |
|  | Unclear |
|  | View |

| Annotation | Meaning |
|------------|-------------------|
| S | Synthesis |
| E | Continuity/Change |

| | Question and Answer | Mark | Guidance |
|---|---|------|---|
| 1 | <p>Evaluate the interpretations in both of the two passages. Explain which you think is more convincing as an explanation of the relationship between the Dominicans and the universities.</p> <p>In locating the interpretations in the wider debate, answers might argue that Interpretation A argues that the coming of the friars, with their lack of need for a patron and their having time to spend on theological study, was a great benefit to the universities as they were able to revolutionise study there.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In evaluating Interpretation A, answers might argue that Interpretation A is valid as friars were supported by their Order and so had no need to find patrons or a career • Answers might argue that A is valid as Friars had time to concentrate on higher level theological studies whereas most students had to leave after the arts course and find a job • Answers might argue that A is valid as some of the greatest theologians of the thirteenth and early fourteenth centuries were Dominicans e.g., Aquinas and Roger Bacon • Answers might argue that A is valid as Dominicans as a preaching order needed to develop their theological thinking in support of their preaching and aims of widespread conversion • Answers might argue that A is valid as universities had done much to train | 30 | <p>The indicative content lists features of the period studied that relate to the question set. <u>Neither significance nor relative importance are attributed to the features listed.</u></p> <p>The indicative content is intended to reflect the knowledge and understanding a candidate is likely to analyse and evaluate in order to arrive at a judgement in line with the question set.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No set answer is expected. • At Level 5 and above answers will evaluate both interpretations, locating them within the wider historical debate about the issue and using their own knowledge, and reach a balanced judgement as to which they consider the most convincing about the issue in the question. • To be valid, judgements must be supported by relevant and accurate material. • Knowledge must not be credited in isolation, it should only be credited where it is used to analyse and evaluate the interpretations, in line with descriptions in the levels mark scheme. |

| | Question and Answer | Mark | Guidance |
|--|---|------|----------|
| | <p>administrators who were needed to run the developing governments of France and England</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Answers might argue that A is less valid as universities did not regard the coming of the friars as an unalloyed benefit. • Answers might argue that A is less valid as it was not only Dominicans who were responsible for this theological development but Franciscans too <p>In locating in the wider debate, answers might argue that Interpretation B argues that the coming of the friars was much resented by secular scholars at Paris and caused much dissension. Paris university felt the need to bring the friars under control and in support of this mentions a number of measures taken to restrict their freedom at the university.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In evaluating Interpretation B, answers might argue that B is valid as secular clerks hated the friars whom they felt had unfair advantages as they had no worries over patrons or careers • Answers might argue that B is valid as, although Paris had to agree to admit friars, the Dominicans were restricted to 2 doctors who could be members of the governing body of the university • Answers might argue that B is valid as imposing an oath of obedience on the Dominicans would have been unacceptable to them, given their oaths of obedience to the Order and the Pope | | |

| | Question and Answer | Mark | Guidance |
|--|---|------|----------|
| | <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Answers might argue that B is valid as Paris was not the only university affected by disputes between the friars and secular clerks as Oxford was in the fourteenth century• Answers might argue that B is less valid as Dominicans lived without trouble at Oxford for almost a century• Answers might argue that B is less valid as Thomas Aquinas was very productively active in Paris at the time and was able to come back to Paris for several years to teach | | |

| | Question & Answer | Mark | Guidance |
|----|---|------|--|
| 2* | <p>‘Intellectual developments were the main reason for the growth of heresy during the period from c.1100 to 1437.’</p> <p>How far do you agree?</p> <p>Candidates might consider some of the following themes: Intellectual ideas, especially of Cathars, Wyclif and Huss; lay piety; condition of the medieval church; local social, economic and political factors</p> <p>In supporting the hypothesis in the question,</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Answers might argue that from the twelfth century Cathars to the later medieval followers of Wyclif and Huss, intellectual developments led to the growth of some heresies • Answers might argue that Cathars’ dualist theology, alternative church with its own rites and development of the idea of the Perfects, led to its growth • Answers might argue that Wyclif’s ideas attacked fundamental Catholic belief on the Eucharist and the importance of the priesthood • Answers might argue that Hussitism grew from Huss’ emphasis on doctrinal matters and led eventually to the establishment of an alternative church in Bohemia <p>In challenging the hypothesis in the question,</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Answers might argue that throughout the period, lay piety, the search by individuals for a purer, more apostolic life, played a part in the growth of most heresies • Answers might argue that the state of the medieval church, with its great wealth, and the | 25 | <p>The indicative content lists features of the period studied that relate to the question set. Both features that support the hypothesis and features that challenge the hypothesis are detailed.</p> <p><u>Neither significance nor relative importance are attributed to the features listed.</u></p> <p>The indicative content is intended to reflect the knowledge and understanding a candidate is likely to analyse and evaluate in order to arrive at a judgement in line with the question set.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No set answer is expected • At higher levels answers might establish criteria against which to judge the validity of the interpretation. • To be valid, judgements must be supported by relevant and accurate material. • Knowledge must not be credited in isolation. It should only be credited where it is used as the basis for analysis and evaluation, in line with descriptions in the levels mark scheme. |

| | Question & Answer | Mark | Guidance |
|--|--|------|----------|
| | <p>moral laxity of the clergy led people to be attracted to heresies which offered purer lives or other means to salvation</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Answers might argue that, especially in the later part of the period, growing dissatisfaction with the papacy also contributed to the growth of heresies • Answers might argue that local social and economic factors could lead to the growth of heresy • Answers might argue that local political factors could lead to the growth of heresy | | |

| | Question & Answer | Mark | Guidance |
|----|---|------|--|
| 3* | <p>‘The nature of the support for the Cathars was similar to that for other heretical movements during the period from c.1100 to 1437’.</p> <p>How far do you agree?</p> <p>Candidates might consider some of the following themes: Gender and social class of support; geographical location of support; length of support; reasons for support</p> <p>In supporting the hypothesis in the question,</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Answers might argue that, like other heretical movements, Cathars attracted men and women, young and old • Answers might argue that, like other movements, Cathars attracted support from a variety of social classes • Answers might argue that, as for other heretical movements, support for Cathars did not last throughout the period | 25 | <p>The indicative content lists features of the period studied that relate to the question set. Both features that support the hypothesis and features that challenge the hypothesis are detailed.</p> <p><u>Neither significance nor relative importance are attributed to the features listed.</u></p> <p>The indicative content is intended to reflect the knowledge and understanding a candidate is likely to analyse and evaluate in order to arrive at a judgement in line with the question set.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No set answer is expected • At higher levels answers might establish criteria against which to judge the validity of the interpretation. • To be valid, judgements must be supported by relevant and accurate material. • Knowledge must not be credited in isolation. It should only be credited where it is used as the basis for analysis and evaluation, in line with descriptions in the levels mark scheme. |

| | Question & Answer | Mark | Guidance |
|----|---|------|---|
| | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Answers might argue that support for Cathars was mainly limited in geographical extent • Answers might argue that, as with other heretical movements, support came partly from those keen to adopt a more austere life <p>In challenging the hypothesis in the question,</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Answers might argue that support for Cathars came mostly from southern France and northern Italy and became so embedded in local society that it took a crusade to deal with it. • Answers might argue that only Hussite support in Bohemia came close to Catharism in the way that it became embedded in society, and it too required military action to suppress it • Answers might argue that Cathars enjoyed more influential support, including noble support, than did most heresies, e.g., Waldensians or Henricians • Answers might argue that its theology attracted support to Catharism and, while this was also true of Lollards and Hussites, it was not the case for most heretical movements • Answers might argue that Catharism was uniquely attractive in offering supporters the chance to delay becoming Perfects until the end of life | | |
| 4* | <p>‘Throughout the period from c 1100 to 1437, the church responded effectively to the threat of heresy.’</p> <p>How far do you agree?</p> | 25 | The indicative content lists features of the period studied that relate to the question set. Both features that support the hypothesis and features that challenge the hypothesis are detailed. |

| | Question & Answer | Mark | Guidance |
|--|--|------|--|
| | <p>Candidates might consider of the following themes: Spread of heresy; time taken to deal with heresies; variety of response; requirement for increasingly repressive measures; appearance of new heresies</p> <p>In supporting the hypothesis in the question,</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Answers might argue that no one heretical movement took hold across Europe; the church dealt with each heresy as it arose • Answers might argue that no heretical movement came anywhere near to the support enjoyed by the Catholic church • Answers might argue that the church's response was flexible and many faceted, including preaching, teaching, propaganda, and more aggressive and repressive measures such as crusades, inquisition, burning • Answers might argue that the infrequency of crusades against heretics suggests the church did not often need to resort to ultimate aggressive action as it had responded effectively <p>In challenging the hypothesis in the question,</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Answers might argue that some heresy was never completely eradicated with the Hussites founding a permanent rival church, and Catharism took a very long time to annihilate • Answers might argue that it proved very difficult to eradicate the Free Spirit movement which was a major concern for the church in the fourteenth century • Answers might argue that the church had to resort to more aggressive measures because less aggressive ones, such as preaching missions, failed | | <p><u>Neither significance nor relative importance are attributed to the features listed.</u></p> <p>The indicative content is intended to reflect the knowledge and understanding a candidate is likely to analyse and evaluate in order to arrive at a judgement in line with the question set.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No set answer is expected. • At higher levels answers might establish criteria against which to judge the validity of the interpretation. • To be valid, judgements must be supported by relevant and accurate material. • Knowledge must not be credited in isolation. It should only be credited where it is used as the basis for analysis and evaluation, in line with descriptions in the levels mark scheme. |

| | Question & Answer | Mark | Guidance |
|--|--|------|----------|
| | <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Answers might argue that lack of willingness or ability on the part of the church, or those through whom it was acting, to take early action meant heresy was more difficult to deal with | | |

APPENDIX 1 – this contains a generic mark scheme grid

| | |
|----------------------------------|--|
| | <i>AO3: Analyse and evaluate, in relation to the historical context, different ways in which aspects of the past have been interpreted.</i> |
| | Generic mark scheme for Section A, Question 1: Interpretation [30] |
| Level 6 26–30 marks | The answer has a very good focus on the question throughout. It has thorough and sustained evaluation of the interpretations, using detailed and accurate knowledge of the historical context and the wider historical debate around the issue, in order to produce a convincing and supported analysis of them in relation to the question. |
| Level 5 21–25 marks | The answer has a good focus on the question throughout. It has good evaluation of the interpretations, using relevant knowledge of the historical context and the wider historical debate around the issue, in order to produce a supported analysis of them in relation to the question. |
| Level 4 16–20 marks | The answer is mostly focused on the question. It has evaluation of the interpretations based on generally relevant knowledge of the historical context and the wider historical debate around the issue, in order to produce an analysis of them in relation to the question. |
| Level 3 11–15 marks | The answer is partially focused on the question. It has partial evaluation of the interpretations based on some knowledge of the historical context and the wider historical debate around the issue. There may be some use of information from one of the two interpretations to support the evaluation of the other, but the evaluation will not rely on this. There is a limited analysis of the interpretations in relation to the question. |
| Level 2 6–10 marks | The answer has a limited focus on the question. Parts of the answer are just description of the interpretations, with evaluation in relation to historical context and the wider historical debate around the issue being weak, and evaluation relying heavily on information drawn from the other interpretation. There is a very limited analysis of the interpretations in relation to the question. |
| Level 1 1–5 marks | The answer has some relevance to the topic, but not the specific question. The answer consists mostly of description of the interpretations with very limited evaluation based on very generalised knowledge of historical context and minimal or no reference to the wider historical debate. Analysis of the interpretations in relation to the question is either in the form of assertion or lacking. |
| 0 marks | No evidence of understanding and no demonstration of any relevant knowledge. |

| | |
|----------------------------------|---|
| | <i>AO1: Demonstrate, organise and communicate knowledge and understanding to analyse and evaluate the key features related to the periods studied, making substantiated judgements and exploring concepts, as relevant, of cause, consequence, change, continuity, similarity, difference and significance.</i> |
| | Generic mark scheme for Section B, Questions 2, 3 and 4: Essay [25] |
| Level 6 21–25 marks | The answer has a very good focus on the question. Detailed and accurate knowledge and understanding is used to analyse and evaluate key features of the period studied in order to reach a fully developed synthesis supporting a convincing and substantiated judgement. There is a well-developed and sustained line of reasoning which is coherent and logically structured. The information presented is entirely relevant and substantiated. |
| Level 5 17–20 marks | The answer has a good focus on the question. Generally accurate and detailed knowledge and understanding is used to analyse and evaluate key features of the period studied in order to reach a developed synthesis supporting a substantiated judgement. There is a well-developed line of reasoning which is clear and logically structured. The information presented is relevant and in the most part substantiated. |
| Level 4 13–16 marks | The answer is mostly focused on the question. Relevant knowledge and understanding is used to analyse and evaluate key features of the period studied in order to reach a synthesis supporting a reasonable judgement. There is a line of reasoning presented with some structure. The information presented is in the most-part relevant and supported by some evidence. |
| Level 3 9–12 marks | The answer has a partial focus on the question. Some relevant knowledge and understanding is used to analyse and explain key features of the period studied in order to attempt an undeveloped synthesis, which is linked to a judgement, though the supporting explanation may lack detail and clarity. The information has some relevance and is presented with limited structure. The information is supported by limited evidence. |
| Level 2 5–8 marks | The answer has only a limited focus on the question. Limited relevant knowledge and understanding is used to give a limited explanation and analysis of key features of the period studied. There is a judgement but this may not be clearly linked with the supporting explanation. The information has some relevance, but is communicated in an unstructured way. The information is supported by limited evidence and the relationship to the evidence may not be clear. |
| Level 1 1–4 marks | The answer has a limited focus on the topic, but not the specific question. The answer is largely descriptive, with only very generalised knowledge of the period studied being used to attempt basic explanation and very limited analysis. Judgements are unsupported and are not linked to analysis. Information presented is basic and may be ambiguous or unstructured. The information is supported by limited evidence. |
| 0 marks | The answer contains no relevant information. |

Need to get in touch?

If you ever have any questions about OCR qualifications or services (including administration, logistics and teaching) please feel free to get in touch with our customer support centre.

Call us on

01223 553998

Alternatively, you can email us on

support@ocr.org.uk

For more information visit



ocr.org.uk/qualifications/resource-finder



ocr.org.uk



Twitter/ocrextams



/ocrextams



/company/ocr



/ocrextams



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS & ASSESSMENT

OCR is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

For staff training purposes and as part of our quality assurance programme your call may be recorded or monitored. © OCR 2024 Oxford Cambridge and RSA Examinations is a Company Limited by Guarantee. Registered in England. Registered office The Triangle Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge, CB2 8EA.

Registered company number 3484466. OCR is an exempt charity.

OCR operates academic and vocational qualifications regulated by Ofqual, Qualifications Wales and CCEA as listed in their qualifications registers including A Levels, GCSEs, Cambridge Technicals and Cambridge Nationals.

OCR provides resources to help you deliver our qualifications. These resources do not represent any particular teaching method we expect you to use. We update our resources regularly and aim to make sure content is accurate but please check the OCR website so that you have the most up-to-date version. OCR cannot be held responsible for any errors or omissions in these resources.

Though we make every effort to check our resources, there may be contradictions between published support and the specification, so it is important that you always use information in the latest specification. We indicate any specification changes within the document itself, change the version number and provide a summary of the changes. If you do notice a discrepancy between the specification and a resource, please [contact us](#).

Whether you already offer OCR qualifications, are new to OCR or are thinking about switching, you can request more information using our [Expression of Interest form](#).

Please [get in touch](#) if you want to discuss the accessibility of resources we offer to support you in delivering our qualifications.