

GCE

History A

Unit : Y304/01 The Church and Medieval Heresy 1100 - 1437

Advanced GCE

Mark Scheme for June 2017

OCR (Oxford Cambridge and RSA) is a leading UK awarding body, providing a wide range of qualifications to meet the needs of candidates of all ages and abilities. OCR qualifications include AS/A Levels, Diplomas, GCSEs, Cambridge Nationals, Cambridge Technicals, Functional Skills, Key Skills, Entry Level qualifications, NVQs and vocational qualifications in areas such as IT, business, languages, teaching/training, administration and secretarial skills.

It is also responsible for developing new specifications to meet national requirements and the needs of students and teachers. OCR is a not-for-profit organisation; any surplus made is invested back into the establishment to help towards the development of qualifications and support, which keep pace with the changing needs of today's society.

This mark scheme is published as an aid to teachers and students, to indicate the requirements of the examination. It shows the basis on which marks were awarded by examiners. It does not indicate the details of the discussions which took place at an examiners' meeting before marking commenced.

















All examiners are instructed that alternative correct answers and unexpected approaches in candidates' scripts must be given marks that fairly reflect the relevant knowledge and skills demonstrated.

Mark schemes should be read in conjunction with the published question papers and the report on the examination.

OCR will not enter into any discussion or correspondence in connection with this mark scheme.

© OCR 2017

These are the annotations, (including abbreviations), including those used in scoris, which are used when marking

Annotation	Meaning of annotation
	Blank Page
	Highlight
Off-page comment	
	Assertion
	Analysis
	Continuity/Change
	Evaluation
	Explanation
	Factor
	Illustrates/Describes
	Irrelevant, a significant amount of material that does not answer the question
	Judgement
	Knowledge and understanding
	Simple comment
	Synthesis
	Unclear
	View

Mark Scheme Section A

Question	Answer	Mark	Guidance
1	<p>Evaluate the interpretations in both of the two passages and explain which you think is more convincing as an explanation of the spread of Wycliffe's ideas.</p> <p>In locating the interpretations within the wider historical debate, answers might argue that Interpretation A argues that although Wycliffite writings were important in spreading Wycliffe's ideas, the most important way in which they were spread as through preaching, not directly by Wycliffe but by Oxford scholars, and in support of this refers to Oxford graduates going into the regions to preach.</p> <p>In evaluating Interpretation A,</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Answers might argue that this is valid as recent research has indicated that not all surviving English Scriptures originally thought to be Lollard are in fact Lollard and so they are not perhaps as important in the spread of Wycliffe's ideas as was originally thought. • Answers might argue that Interpretation A is made more convincing as it is supported by Interpretation B which mentions historians rethinking their views about the spread of Wycliffe's ideas. • Answers might argue that Interpretation A is valid as once Wycliffe was condemned by the pope he probably did not have the opportunity to preach outside Oxford. • Answers might argue that Interpretation A is valid as there is evidence of particular named Oxford graduates preaching Wycliffe's ideas outside Oxford. 	30	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No set answer is required • At Level 5 and above answers will evaluate both interpretations, locating them within the wider historical debate about the issue and using their own knowledge and reach a balanced judgement as to which they consider the most convincing about the issue in the question • To be valid, judgements must be supported by relevant and accurate material • Knowledge must not be credited in isolation, it should only be credited where it is used to analyse and evaluate the interpretations, in line with the descriptions in the levels mark scheme.

Question	Answer	Mark	Guidance
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Answers might argue that Interpretation A is made more convincing as it is supported by Interpretation B which also refers to the work of graduate preachers in spreading Wycliffe's ideas. • Answers might argue that Interpretation A is less valid as it deals with a limited range of factors. <p>In locating the interpretations within the wider historical debate, answers might argue that Interpretation B argues that Wycliffe's ideas spread for a number of reasons: development of his ideas by his followers, including writings; the relevance of his ideas; the importance of preaching by Oxford scholars in the regions; and collaboration between Oxford graduates and Lollard gentry.</p> <p>In evaluating Interpretation B</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Answers might argue that this is convincing as Oxford scholars taught by Wycliffe could have been appointed to benefices in different parts of the country by their colleges and so would be well placed to preach Wycliffe's ideas. • Answers might argue that Interpretation B is correct as there were lollard knights such as Sir John Oldcastle and others who were patrons of the lollards in the early years. • Answers might argue that Interpretation B could be considered valid because it acknowledges that in the past the number of translated Bibles produced was thought to indicate widespread lollard following but that the importance of these translations in the spread of Wycliffe's views has now been revised. • Answers might argue that Interpretation B could be considered valid as it acknowledges the appeal to a wider audience of Wycliffe's challenge to Church 		

Question	Answer	Mark	Guidance
	<p>and devotional practice and this is further supported by the support for these ideas among the 'middling sort', including craftsmen, merchants and yeomen.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Answers might argue that Interpretation B is convincing as it recognises that a variety of factors accounted for the spread of Wycliffe's ideas. 		

Question	Answer	Mark	Guidance
2*	<p>Mark Scheme Section B</p> <p>‘Dissatisfaction with the condition of the medieval church was the main reason for the emergence of heretical movements in the period 1100-1437.’ How far do you agree?</p> <p>In supporting the hypothesis in the question, it might be argued that dissatisfaction with the condition of the church took a number of forms during the period but that it led to heresy throughout the period.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Answers might consider that dissatisfaction with the wealth and moral laxity of the clergy, leading to anticlericalism, led to heretical movements throughout the period from Waldensians to Lollards and Hussites. • Answers might consider that there was dissatisfaction with the quality of the popes, intensified by the Great Schism, which led people to question papal authority. • Answers might consider that the condition of the Catholic Church contrasted with the life of Christ and the apostles as seen in the Gospels and this led to heretical movements from the twelfth century. • Answers might consider that in the fourteenth century the existence of wealthy and corrupt ecclesiastical institutions led some to put the emphasis on the Bible as the means to salvation and so on the importance of reading it for oneself and having vernacular translations. • Answers might argue that the condition of the church led some to reject the usefulness of the church and the efficacy of its sacraments. • Answers might consider that ineffective 	25	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No set answer is expected • At higher levels answers might establish criteria against which to judge • To be valid judgments must be supported by relevant and accurate material • Knowledge must not be credited in isolation, it should only be credited where it is used as the basis for analysis and evaluation, in line with descriptions in the levels mark scheme.

Question	Answer	Mark	Guidance
<p>3*</p>	<p>administration in some dioceses gave opportunities for heresy to flourish.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Answers might consider that heretical movements were multi-causal but that dissatisfaction with the condition of the church was usually a factor. <p>In challenging the hypothesis in the question, it might be argued that at various times other factors were more important than dissatisfaction with the condition of the church .</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Answers might consider that socio-economic conditions helped lead to the emergence of the Cathars and to heresy in the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries. • Answers might consider that doctrinal issues led to heresy in both the early (Cathars) and later (Wycliffe) parts of the period. • Answers might consider that popular piety, a search for God and godliness, led people to seek an alternative to the Catholic Church. • Answers might consider that local political factors helped lead to heresy particularly in southern France, England and Bohemia. • Answers might consider that unwillingness or inability of the authorities to deal with heresy in its infancy allowed it to emerge fully. <p>How far did the reasons for the limited success of heretical movements in the years 1100-1437 stay the same?</p> <p>In supporting the hypothesis in the question, it might be argued that, throughout the period, the church took action against heretics which was mostly effective</p>	<p>25</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No set answer is expected • At higher levels answers might establish criteria against which to judge. • To be valid judgments must be supported by relevant and accurate material • Knowledge must not be credited in isolation, it should only be credited where it is used as the basis for analysis and evaluation, in line with descriptions in the

Question	Answer	Mark	Guidance
4*	<p>eventually.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Answers might consider that the church recognised the need to change its methods of dealing with heresy as time went on: preaching; crusade from early thirteenth century; Inquisition and burning from 1230s. • Answers might consider that throughout the period there were movements which failed to permeate the society in which they existed and so did not attract the necessary protection when attacked by the church. <p>In challenging the hypothesis in the question it might be argued that different reasons lay behind the limited success of different movements.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Answers might consider that the limited success of some movements was due to limited support, or to limited influential support. • Answers might consider that some heretical movements became associated with social and/or political radicalism which led to lack of support and action by state authorities. • Answers might consider that lack of organisation led to the limited success of some movements. • Answers might consider that Cathars' limited success was due to Innocent III's particular zeal and determination to deal with heresy. <p>'The Cathars were the heretical movement who presented the greatest challenge to the Church in the period 1100-1437.' How far do you agree?</p> <p>In supporting the hypothesis in the question, it might be argued that the Cathars permeated French society,</p>	25	<p>levels mark scheme.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No set answer is expected • At higher levels answers might establish criteria against which to judge. • To be valid judgments must be supported by relevant and accurate material • Knowledge must not be credited in isolation, it should only be credited where it is used as the basis for

Question	Answer	Mark	Guidance
	<p>attracting aristocratic support and protection, and so it was very difficult to eradicate them. Others, apart from the Hussites, did not achieve this support.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Answers might consider that Cathar organisation seemed to compete with the Catholic Church. Most other groups were less well organised. • Answers might consider that the Cathars were deemed worthy of a crusade against them. Only the Hussites also attracted a crusade. • Answers might consider that the purity of Cathar Perfects was seen as very attractive and a contrast to the laxity of catholic clergy but this went beyond the simple appeal of apostolic poverty followed by some other popular movements. • Answers might consider that vigorous preaching against the Cathars for half a century had failed to have much effect and they were able to out-argue catholic clergy. • Answers might consider that Cathars went beyond other heretical groups of the twelfth/ early thirteenth centuries in developing an alternative dualist theology which made them a threat to the Catholic Church. <p>In challenging the hypothesis in the question it might be argued that they had little influence on anyone else, except some Waldensians.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Answers might consider that the Cathars were eradicated by 1310. • Answers might consider that Wycliffe and the Lollards were a challenge as this was the first real heresy in England, and their views could be seen as undermining the whole importance of the catholic priesthood. • Answers might consider that Hussites were well 		<p>analysis and evaluation, in line with descriptions in the levels mark scheme.</p>

Question	Answer	Mark	Guidance
	<p>organized and created a distinctive church in Bohemia which, unlike the Cathars, was permanent.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Answers might consider that, like the Cathars, the Free Spirit movement was very difficult to eradicate, difficult to find and was the major concern of the Catholic Church in the fourteenth century.		

APPENDIX 1 – this contains the generic mark scheme grids

	<i>AO3: Analyse and evaluate, in relation to the historical context, different ways in which aspects of the past have been interpreted.</i>
	Generic mark scheme for Section A, Question 1: Interpretation [30]
Level 6 26–30 marks	The answer has a very good focus on the question throughout. It has thorough and sustained evaluation of the interpretations, using detailed and accurate knowledge of the historical context and the wider historical debate around the issue, in order to produce a convincing and supported analysis of them in relation to the question.
Level 5 21–25 marks	The answer has a good focus on the question throughout. It has good evaluation of the interpretations, using relevant knowledge of the historical context and the wider historical debate around the issue, in order to produce a supported analysis of them in relation to the question.
Level 4 16–20 marks	The answer is mostly focused on the question. It has evaluation of the interpretations based on generally relevant knowledge of the historical context and the wider historical debate around the issue, in order to produce an analysis of them in relation to the question.
Level 3 11–15 marks	The answer is partially focused on the question. It has partial evaluation of the interpretations based on some knowledge of the historical context and the wider historical debate around the issue. There may be some use of information from one of the two interpretations to support the evaluation of the other, but the evaluation will not rely on this. There is a limited analysis of the interpretations in relation to the question.
Level 2 6–10 marks	The answer has a limited focus on the question. Parts of the answer are just description of the interpretations, with evaluation in relation to historical context and the wider historical debate around the issue being weak, and evaluation relying heavily on information drawn from the other interpretation. There is a very limited analysis of the interpretations in relation to the question.
Level 1 1–5 marks	The answer has some relevance to the topic, but not the specific question. The answer consists mostly of description of the interpretations with very limited evaluation based on very generalised knowledge of historical context and minimal or no reference to the wider historical debate. Analysis of the interpretations in relation to the question is either in the form of assertion or lacking.
0 marks	No evidence of understanding and no demonstration of any relevant knowledge.

	<i>AO1: Demonstrate, organise and communicate knowledge and understanding to analyse and evaluate the key features related to the periods studied, making substantiated judgements and exploring concepts, as relevant, of cause, consequence, change, continuity, similarity, difference and significance.</i>
	Generic mark scheme for Section B, Questions 2, 3 and 4: Essay [25]
Level 6 21–25 marks	The answer has a very good focus on the question. Detailed and accurate knowledge and understanding is used to analyse and evaluate key features of the period studied in order to reach a fully developed synthesis supporting a convincing and substantiated judgement. There is a well-developed and sustained line of reasoning which is coherent and logically structured. The information presented is entirely relevant and substantiated.
Level 5 17–20 marks	The answer has a good focus on the question. Generally accurate and detailed knowledge and understanding is used to analyse and evaluate key features of the period studied in order to reach a developed synthesis supporting a substantiated judgement. There is a well-developed line of reasoning which is clear and logically structured. The information presented is relevant and in the most part substantiated.
Level 4 13–16 marks	The answer is mostly focused on the question. Relevant knowledge and understanding is used to analyse and evaluate key features of the period studied in order to reach a synthesis supporting a reasonable judgement. There is a line of reasoning presented with some structure. The information presented is in the most-part relevant and supported by some evidence.
Level 3 9–12 marks	The answer has a partial focus on the question. Some relevant knowledge and understanding is used to analyse and explain key features of the period studied in order to attempt an undeveloped synthesis, which is linked to a judgement, though the supporting explanation may lack detail and clarity. The information has some relevance and is presented with limited structure. The information is supported by limited evidence.
Level 2 5–8 marks	The answer has only a limited focus on the question. Limited relevant knowledge and understanding is used to give a limited explanation and analysis of key features of the period studied. There is a judgement but this may not be clearly linked with the supporting explanation. The information has some relevance, but is communicated in an unstructured way. The information is supported by limited evidence and the relationship to the evidence may not be clear.
Level 1 1–4 marks	The answer has a limited focus on the topic, but not the specific question. The answer is largely descriptive, with only very generalised knowledge of the period studied being used to attempt basic explanation and very limited analysis. Judgements are unsupported and are not linked to analysis. Information presented is basic and may be ambiguous or unstructured. The information is supported by limited evidence.
0 marks	The answer contains no relevant information.

OCR (Oxford Cambridge and RSA Examinations)
1 Hills Road
Cambridge
CB1 2EU

OCR Customer Contact Centre

Education and Learning

Telephone: 01223 553998

Facsimile: 01223 552627

Email: general.qualifications@ocr.org.uk

www.ocr.org.uk

For staff training purposes and as part of our quality assurance programme your call may be recorded or monitored

Oxford Cambridge and RSA Examinations
is a Company Limited by Guarantee
Registered in England
Registered Office; 1 Hills Road, Cambridge, CB1 2EU
Registered Company Number: 3484466
OCR is an exempt Charity

OCR (Oxford Cambridge and RSA Examinations)
Head office
Telephone: 01223 552552
Facsimile: 01223 552553

© OCR 2017

