



GCE

History A

Y316/01: Britain and Ireland 1791-1921

Advanced GCE

Mark Scheme for June 2019

OCR (Oxford Cambridge and RSA) is a leading UK awarding body, providing a wide range of qualifications to meet the needs of candidates of all ages and abilities. OCR qualifications include AS/A Levels, Diplomas, GCSEs, Cambridge Nationals, Cambridge Technicals, Functional Skills, Key Skills, Entry Level qualifications, NVQs and vocational qualifications in areas such as IT, business, languages, teaching/training, administration and secretarial skills.

It is also responsible for developing new specifications to meet national requirements and the needs of students and teachers. OCR is a not-for-profit organisation; any surplus made is invested back into the establishment to help towards the development of qualifications and support, which keep pace with the changing needs of today's society.

This mark scheme is published as an aid to teachers and students, to indicate the requirements of the examination. It shows the basis on which marks were awarded by examiners. It does not indicate the details of the discussions which took place at an examiners' meeting before marking commenced.

All examiners are instructed that alternative correct answers and unexpected approaches in candidates' scripts must be given marks that fairly reflect the relevant knowledge and skills demonstrated.

Mark schemes should be read in conjunction with the published question papers and the report on the examination.

© OCR 2019

These are the annotations, (including abbreviations), including those used in scoris, which are used when marking

Annotation	Meaning of annotation
BP	Blank Page
	Highlight
Off-page comment	
A	Assertion
AN	Analysis
EVAL	Evaluation
EXP	Explanation
F	Factor
ILL	Illustrates/Describes
IRRL	Irrelevant, a significant amount of material that does not answer the question
J	Judgement
KU	Knowledge and understanding
SC	Simple comment
	Unclear
V	View

2. Here is the mark scheme for this question paper.

MARK SCHEME Section A

Question	Answer/Indicative content	Mark	Guidance
1	<p>Evaluate the interpretations in both of the two passages and explain which you think is more convincing in explaining the importance of O’Connell during the period of Catholic Emancipation.</p> <p>In locating the Interpretations within the wider historical debate, answers might argue that Interpretation A suggests although O’Connell was important in the passing of Roman Catholic Emancipation there were other factors that were also important and his achievements need to be seen in the context of the time.</p> <p>In evaluating Interpretation A, answers might argue that Interpretation A is valid because Catholic Emancipation could be passed only if the British parliament agreed.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Answers might argue that Interpretation A is invalid because Catholic Emancipation was not a major achievement as it liberated only a minority of Catholics who could meet the property qualification. • Answers might argue that Interpretation A is valid because O’Connell created a mass movement which was able to exploit the opportunity Wellington allowed. • Answers might argue that Interpretation A is valid because O’Connell used extra-parliamentary means to change the law. • Answers might argue that Interpretation A is valid because it is more balanced in its assessment of 	30	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No set answer is expected. • At Level 5 and above answers will evaluate both interpretations, locating them within the wider historical debate about the issue and using their own knowledge, and reach a balanced judgement as to which they consider the most convincing about the issue in the question. • To be valid, judgements must be supported by relevant and accurate material. • Knowledge must not be credited in isolation, it should only be credited where it is used to analyse and evaluate the interpretations, in line with descriptions in the levels mark scheme.

		<p>O'Connell.</p> <p>In locating the Interpretations within the wider historical debate, answers might argue that Interpretation B argues O'Connell played a significant role in the passing of Catholic Emancipation and that this had a considerable impact on future political developments.</p> <p>In evaluating Interpretation B, answers might argue that interpretation B is valid in its appreciation of O'Connell's achievement as he forced the British government to confront an issue that had been divisive since 1800.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Answers might argue that Interpretation B is valid because O'Connell was an elite politician and made no effort to resist or revise the significant increase in voting qualifications maintained by the 1832 Act. • Answers might argue that Interpretation B is valid because the Whig government of the 1830s passed a significant number of reforms. • Answers might argue that Interpretation B is invalid because it ignores O'Connell's influence on the emergent nationalist Catholic culture. • Answers might argue that Interpretation B is invalid because it fails to appreciate O'Connell's role in dividing the religious communities 		
2		<p>'Revolutionary nationalism achieved more than constitutional nationalism.' How far do you agree with this view of Irish nationalism in the period from 1798</p>	25	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No set answer is expected. • At higher levels answers might establish criteria against which to judge.

	<p>to 1921?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In supporting the hypothesis that revolutionary nationalism achieved more than constitutional nationalism, it might be argued that ultimately a separate Irish state, albeit only in the south, was established as a result of revolutionary activity at the end of the period. • Answers might consider the impact of Wolfe Tone and the United Irishmen and argue that its importance was in creating the mythology of Irish republican nationalism even if the rebellion achieved little in the short-term. • Answers might consider the impact of Young Ireland and the ideal of an independent Irish republic and also the notion of a land war between tenant and landlord. • Answers might consider the impact of the Fenians and the backlash their tactics created in England. This might be contrasted with the impact that they had on Gladstone and his policies. • Answers might consider the support and impact of the Land League. Their influence made the situation in Ireland difficult to control and created difficulties for constitutional nationalists, such as Parnell. • Answers might consider the impact of Sinn Fein and their insistence on complete independence and the impact this had on Irish Parliamentary Party and Redmond. • Answers might consider the significance of the Easter Rising of 1916 and its influence on public opinion. • Answers might consider the impact of the Anglo-Irish War of 1919-21. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To be valid, judgements must be supported by relevant and accurate material. • Knowledge must not be credited in isolation, it should only be credited where it is used as the basis for analysis and evaluation, in line with descriptions in the levels mark scheme.
--	---	---

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In challenging the hypothesis in the question and arguing that constitutional nationalism achieved more it might be argued constitutional nationalism brought about reform in Ireland for much of the period, and it was only in the last years that revolutionary nationalism achieved more. • Answers might consider the role of O'Connell in bringing about Catholic Emancipation and his influence in the 1830s and 1840s. • Answers might consider the impact of Parnell on the Home Rule debate and his influence on Gladstone. • Answers might consider the significance of Redmond and the Irish Parliamentary Party and their support for the Liberals and achievement of Home Rule. • Answers might consider the impact of the Home Rule movement. • Answers might consider the influence of the Roman Catholic Church in opposition. • Answers might consider the development of cultural nationalism, including the Enlightenment, Young Ireland and the Gaelic revival. 		
3		<p>'Ireland gained more from the policies of Tory, Conservative and Coalition governments than it did from Whig and Liberal ones in the period from 1798 to 1921.' How far do you agree?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In supporting the hypothesis that Tory, Conservative and Coalition governments did more, it might be argued that they made a number of concessions. • Answers might consider the economic 	25	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No set answer is expected. • At higher levels answers might establish criteria against which to judge. • To be valid, judgements must be supported by relevant and accurate material. • Knowledge must not be credited in isolation, it should only be credited where it is used as the basis for analysis and evaluation, in line with descriptions in the levels mark scheme.

		<p>concessions made and discuss Peel's land proposals, the Land Purchase Acts of the Balfour Wyndham period.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Answers might consider the major concession of Roman Catholic Emancipation by Peel and Wellington. • Answers might consider the political concessions involved in Pitt's Act of Union, the devolution of local power in the 1880s and 1890s and Lloyd George's coalition conceding the Government of Ireland Act in 1920 which granted Home Rule and was followed by the Anglo-Irish Treaty conceding an Irish Free State with Dominion Status. • In challenging the hypothesis in the question, it might be argued that constitutional nationalists usually preferred to work with Whigs and Liberals who conceded much on religion and economic reform. • Answers might consider that the Whigs/Liberals conceded over the issue of tithes in 1838 and disestablishment of the Church under Gladstone. • Answers might consider that it was the Whigs who conceded Land Reform in the 1870s and 1880s and also carried out economic rationalisation under Birrell's Chief Secretaryship to 1916. • Answers might consider that both governments often resorted to coercion, the Whigs established a police force in the 1830s, the Liberals coerced in the 1880s, whilst there was coercion under Pitt, Peel and Balfour. 		
--	--	---	--	--

4		<p>‘Home Rule was the most important turning point in reform within the Union in the period from 1800 to 1921.’ How far do you agree?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In supporting the hypothesis in the question, it might be argued that Home Rule changed government thinking, even if the Union remained until 1921. • Answers might consider the fact that a major British political party committed to Home Rule. • Answers might consider the problem of getting Home Rule through the Lords and its dependency upon a unified Liberal party and a Liberal majority. • Answers might consider the importance of the 1912 Home Rule bill as it followed the ending of the Lord’s veto. • Answers might consider that the Liberal party ignored Home rule between 1894 and 1910. • Answers might consider how little Home rule would deliver to Irish nationalism with very restricted powers and no representation at Westminster. • Answers might consider how it strengthened Unionist feeling in Ulster. • Answers might consider how the south rejected Home Rule and Ulster accepted it. • Answers might consider that it gave only minor powers to Ireland and therefore did little to undermine the Union. • In challenging the hypothesis in the question, it might be argued that Catholic Emancipation was more important as it conceded a core part of Union, suggesting that there could be concessions made 	25	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No set answer is expected. • At higher levels answers might establish criteria against which to judge. • To be valid, judgements must be supported by relevant and accurate material. • Knowledge must not be credited in isolation, it should only be credited where it is used as the basis for analysis and evaluation, in line with descriptions in the levels mark scheme.
---	--	--	----	--

			<p>to the Union. It might be seen as a more important turning point as it gave Catholics the right to political office holding and represented a key change in approach to the role of the Protestant ascendancy as Ireland's ruling class.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Answers might consider the impact of disestablishment in 1869 which conceded on religious aspects of the Union.• Answers might consider the impact of various land reforms and their impact on the Union. These took place from the 1830s and it might be argued they were a major turning point as they provided a successor group, the Catholic tenant farmer, to the Protestant ascendancy.• Answers might consider the importance of Maynooth.		
--	--	--	--	--	--

APPENDIX 1 – this contains a generic mark scheme grid

	<i>AO3: Analyse and evaluate, in relation to the historical context, different ways in which aspects of the past have been interpreted.</i>
	Generic mark scheme for Section A, Question 1: Interpretation [30]
Level 6 26–30 marks	The answer has a very good focus on the question throughout. It has thorough and sustained evaluation of the interpretations, using detailed and accurate knowledge of the historical context and the wider historical debate around the issue, in order to produce a convincing and supported analysis of them in relation to the question.
Level 5 21–25 marks	The answer has a good focus on the question throughout. It has good evaluation of the interpretations, using relevant knowledge of the historical context and the wider historical debate around the issue, in order to produce a supported analysis of them in relation to the question.
Level 4 16–20 marks	The answer is mostly focused on the question. It has evaluation of the interpretations based on generally relevant knowledge of the historical context and the wider historical debate around the issue, in order to produce an analysis of them in relation to the question.
Level 3 11–15 marks	The answer is partially focused on the question. It has partial evaluation of the interpretations based on some knowledge of the historical context and the wider historical debate around the issue. There may be some use of information from one of the two interpretations to support the evaluation of the other, but the evaluation will not rely on this. There is a limited analysis of the interpretations in relation to the question.
Level 2 6–10 marks	The answer has a limited focus on the question. Parts of the answer are just description of the interpretations, with evaluation in relation to historical context and the wider historical debate around the issue being weak, and evaluation relying heavily on information drawn from the other interpretation. There is a very limited analysis of the interpretations in relation to the question.
Level 1 1–5 marks	The answer has some relevance to the topic, but not the specific question. The answer consists mostly of description of the interpretations with very limited evaluation based on very generalised knowledge of historical context and minimal or no reference to the wider historical debate. Analysis of the interpretations in relation to the question is either in the form of assertion or lacking.
0 marks	No evidence of understanding and no demonstration of any relevant knowledge.

	<i>AO1: Demonstrate, organise and communicate knowledge and understanding to analyse and evaluate the key features related to the periods studied, making substantiated judgements and exploring concepts, as relevant, of cause, consequence, change, continuity, similarity, difference and significance.</i>
	Generic mark scheme for Section B, Questions 2, 3 and 4: Essay [25]
Level 6 21–25 marks	The answer has a very good focus on the question. Detailed and accurate knowledge and understanding is used to analyse and evaluate key features of the period studied in order to reach a fully developed synthesis supporting a convincing and substantiated judgement. There is a well-developed and sustained line of reasoning which is coherent and logically structured. The information presented is entirely relevant and substantiated.
Level 5 17–20 marks	The answer has a good focus on the question. Generally accurate and detailed knowledge and understanding is used to analyse and evaluate key features of the period studied in order to reach a developed synthesis supporting a substantiated judgement. There is a well-developed line of reasoning which is clear and logically structured. The information presented is relevant and in the most part substantiated.
Level 4 13–16 marks	The answer is mostly focused on the question. Relevant knowledge and understanding is used to analyse and evaluate key features of the period studied in order to reach a synthesis supporting a reasonable judgement. There is a line of reasoning presented with some structure. The information presented is in the most-part relevant and supported by some evidence.
Level 3 9–12 marks	The answer has a partial focus on the question. Some relevant knowledge and understanding is used to analyse and explain key features of the period studied in order to attempt an undeveloped synthesis, which is linked to a judgement, though the supporting explanation may lack detail and clarity. The information has some relevance and is presented with limited structure. The information is supported by limited evidence.
Level 2 5–8 marks	The answer has only a limited focus on the question. Limited relevant knowledge and understanding is used to give a limited explanation and analysis of key features of the period studied. There is a judgement but this may not be clearly linked with the supporting explanation. The information has some relevance, but is communicated in an unstructured way. The information is supported by limited evidence and the relationship to the evidence may not be clear.
Level 1 1–4 marks	The answer has a limited focus on the topic, but not the specific question. The answer is largely descriptive, with only very generalised knowledge of the period studied being used to attempt basic explanation and very limited analysis. Judgements are unsupported and are not linked to analysis. Information presented is basic and may be ambiguous or unstructured. The information is supported by limited evidence.
0 marks	The answer contains no relevant information.

OCR (Oxford Cambridge and RSA Examinations)
The Triangle Building
Shaftesbury Road
Cambridge
CB2 8EA

OCR Customer Contact Centre

Education and Learning

Telephone: 01223 553998

Facsimile: 01223 552627

Email: general.qualifications@ocr.org.uk

www.ocr.org.uk

For staff training purposes and as part of our quality assurance programme your call may be recorded or monitored

Oxford Cambridge and RSA Examinations
is a Company Limited by Guarantee
Registered in England
Registered Office; The Triangle Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge, CB2 8EA
Registered Company Number: 3484466
OCR is an exempt Charity

OCR (Oxford Cambridge and RSA Examinations)
Head office
Telephone: 01223 552552
Facsimile: 01223 552553

© OCR 2019

