



GCSE MARKING SCHEME

SUMMER 2016

**HISTORY - STUDY IN-DEPTH
WESTWARD MIGRATION: THE AMERICAN WEST,
1840-1895
4271/06**

INTRODUCTION

This marking scheme was used by WJEC for the 2016 examination. It was finalised after detailed discussion at examiners' conferences by all the examiners involved in the assessment. The conference was held shortly after the paper was taken so that reference could be made to the full range of candidates' responses, with photocopied scripts forming the basis of discussion. The aim of the conference was to ensure that the marking scheme was interpreted and applied in the same way by all examiners.

It is hoped that this information will be of assistance to centres but it is recognised at the same time that, without the benefit of participation in the examiners' conference, teachers may have different views on certain matters of detail or interpretation.

WJEC regrets that it cannot enter into any discussion or correspondence about this marking scheme.

NOTE ON THE QUALITY OF WRITTEN COMMUNICATION

Examiners are required to credit the quality of written communication for each candidate's performance on particular questions. These are question 2(c) and question 3. There are no additional marks for the Quality of Written Communication, but examiners are expected to consider the following descriptions of performance when awarding levels to the work of candidates:

Level 1	the text is generally legible; aspects of spelling, punctuation and grammar are clear; some information is presented in a suitable manner
Level 2	most of the text is legible; spelling, punctuation and grammar are used to make the meaning clear; information is presented in a suitable format
Level 3	the text is legible; spelling, punctuation and grammar are sufficiently accurate to make meaning clear; relevant information is presented in a suitable format; uses an appropriate structure and style of writing; uses some specialist vocabulary
Level 4	the text is legible; spelling, punctuation and grammar are consistently accurate to make meaning clear; information is always presented in a suitable format; uses an appropriate structure and style of writing; uses specialist vocabulary accurately

PAPER 4271/06

UNIT 1: STUDY IN-DEPTH

WESTWARD MIGRATION: THE AMERICAN WEST,
1840-1895

MARKING SCHEME

QUESTION 1

Question 1 (a)

Target:	Understanding of source material Westward Migration: The American West, 1840-1895		
Mark allocation:	AO1	AO2	AO3
4			4

Question: **What do Sources A and B suggest about the methods used by the US government to destroy the Indian way of life?** [4]

Use 0 for incorrect or irrelevant answers.

LEVEL 1 Generalised answer, paraphrasing or describing sources only. [1-2]

Eg: Source A states that reservations destroyed the traditional way of life of the Indians. Source B shows Indian children in a school set up by the US government. They have been taken away from their families.

LEVEL 2 Uses the content of both sources in their historical context. If answer is imbalanced in use of sources award 3 marks. [3-4]

Eg: The two sources show a range of methods used to destroy Indian society. Source A states that the government put Indians on reservations. They could not produce/hunt their own food and became reliant on the government. The power of the chiefs, the traditional leader, was also undermined by agents. Source B shows Indian boys who have been taken from their own villages and sent to a government boarding school. They have been made to look like white children - wearing "white" dress and had their hair cut short.

Question 1 (b)

Target:	Understanding of source material; recall and deployment of own knowledge		
Mark allocation:	AO1	AO2	AO3
6	4		2

Question: **Use Source C and your own knowledge to explain why Sitting Bull was such an important leader of the Plains Indians.** [6]

Use 0 for incorrect or irrelevant answers.

LEVEL 1 Generalised answer; copies or paraphrases source material; uses content of source only. [1-2]

Eg: The source states that Sitting Bull was a brave warrior, a reputation he had had since the age of 14. He led the resistance of the tribes to the encroachment by white people on to the plains.

LEVEL 2 Understands content of the source with some background knowledge. [3-4]

Eg: The source explains that Sitting Bull was a brave warrior who inspired the Plains Indians to resist as white settlers moved on to their land. He refused to sign the Fort Laramie Treaty in 1868 and engaged in guerilla tactics throughout the late 1860s and into the 1870s. His reputation for "strong medicine" encouraged bands other than the Sioux to join him. Things came to a head in 1876 – the Battle of the Little Big Horn – his vision of the defeat of Custer's 7th cavalry inspired his force of Sioux and Cheyenne to victory.

LEVEL 3 Clear use of the content of the source with accurate and detailed background knowledge used to explain the issue. [5-6]

Eg: The source gives clear reasons why Sitting Bull inspired The Plains Indians. From an early age he had shown great bravery and led resistance to white settlement on the Plains. He refused to sign the Fort Laramie Treaty, believing that it would not be honoured. He was also a spiritual leader for his people. His visions inspired them, as much as his courage. He succeeded in uniting some of the tribes, which was almost unheard of. After the Big Horn he went to Canada for 4 years, but then returned to the USA in 1881. He was killed in 1890 in the Standing Rock Agency by Indian Police, when it was feared he would become a leader for the Ghost Dance movement. Even after death the government still feared him. They kept his body and buried him in Fort Yates, instead of returning it to his family.

Question 1 (c)

Target:	Understand, analyse and evaluate source material: recall and deployment of own knowledge		
Mark allocation:	AO1	AO2	AO3
8	2		6

Question: **How useful are Sources D and E to an historian studying the reasons for the Plains Wars?** [8]

Use 0 for incorrect or irrelevant answers.

LEVEL 1 **Comprehends content of the sources; little focus on utility.** [1-2]

Eg: Source D states that white settlers are destroying the Indian lands and animals. Source E shows how the government sent an expedition to find gold on to Sioux land.

LEVEL 2 **Considers usefulness of the sources in terms of both their content and their authorship.** [3-4]

Eg: Source D is useful because it tells us that the Indians were annoyed because white settlers were entering their land and killing the animals on which they relied. Chief Bear Tooth is suggesting that the government has done nothing to stop this. Source E is useful because it is a photograph from 1874 which shows that an expedition was sent by the government into the Sioux reservation. The number of wagons and men shows that the government realised this might anger the Sioux.

LEVEL 3 **Evaluates both sources in context with some imbalance; reaches conclusion regarding utility for the set enquiry.** [5-6]

Eg: The sources are both quite useful for different reasons in studying the reasons for the Plains Wars. Source D is useful, as it explains the issue from the Indian point of view. White settlers have entered Indian land and are killing animals for sport. This has angered Chief Bear Tooth, who is pointing out to the government that this is destroying the Indian way of life. He is pointing out that the government has done nothing to stop it. Source E shows that the government was sending an expedition to look for gold in the Black Hills. This was breaking the terms of the treaty it had signed with the Sioux. It is an official photograph so this implies that the government is not trying to hide the fact. Though it is only one image from the time, the size of the force indicates that they may be expecting problems, especially as the Black Hills were sacred lands.

LEVEL 4 **Evaluates both sources regarding the specific historical context; reaches reasoned and substantiated conclusion regarding their utility for the set enquiry.** **[7-8]**

Eg: Both sources are useful in their different ways in explaining the reasons for the Plains Wars. Source D gives us an Indian point of view and is useful because it explains their anger at white settlers who are destroying their land and the animals which they hunt. Chief Bear Tooth is also angry at the government for failing to prevent this. He is pointing out their hypocrisy by stating that, if Indians killed the animals of white settlers, the government would declare war. Though he is in Fort Laramie and surrounded by US soldiers, he is refusing to be brow-beaten. He is hinting that the government do not hold to their treaties (as evidenced in Source E.) Source E shows how the government sent wagons and troops, to search for gold, into land that belonged to the Indians. To make matters worse this was sacred ground, which meant that it was a provocative move. The size of the force shows that they may be expecting trouble, but are also determined to carry out their plan. This photograph is useful as it shows that for the government the acquisition of gold is more important than its treaties with the Indians.

QUESTION 2

Question 2 (a)

Target:	Recall and deployment of knowledge		
Mark allocation:	AO1	AO2	AO3
4	4		

Question: **Describe the importance of the horse to the lifestyle of the Plains Indians.** [4]

Use 0 for incorrect or irrelevant answers.

LEVEL 1 Generalised answer with weak or implied points made. [1-2]

Eg: The horse was an essential part of the Indian way of life. It was used for hunting and in warfare. The various tribes on the Plains measured their wealth in horses.

LEVEL 2 A more detailed and accurate description. [3-4]

Eg: The horse was essential to life on the Plains. The Plains had, in fact, only been inhabited by Indian tribes after the arrival of the horse in the Americas. Horses were used to hunt buffalo and other game and for warfare. They were also essential as pack animals as the tribes followed the buffalo herds. The tribes as a whole, and individuals within each tribe, measured their wealth in horses. Chiefs gave horses as gifts and young men used them to obtain a bride.

Question 2(b)

Target:	Understand and analyse source material; recall and deployment of knowledge		
Mark allocation:	AO1	AO2	AO3
6	2		4

Question: **Why was Source F produced in 1849?** [6]

Use 0 for incorrect or irrelevant answers.

LEVEL 1 **Comprehends content of the source; little focus on why it was produced.** [1-2]

Eg: The source was produced to advertise travel by steamship to California. Gold had been discovered in California.

LEVEL 2 **Considers the source in its historical context; suggests some reasons for its production.** [3-4]

Eg: The source was produced as an advert to persuade people to travel by ship to the gold fields of California. It was described as being quicker, cheaper and safer than going by land. Gold had been discovered in California and people wanted to get there as quickly as possible to make their fortunes. The poster is taking advantage of this need.

LEVEL 3 **Analyses the source in its historical context; gives detailed reasons regarding its production at the time.** [5-6]

Eg: Source F was one of many posters that appeared in New York in 1848-1849 advertising quick travel by sea to California. Gold had been discovered and the whole country was gripped by gold fever. Rumours abounded of men making their fortunes overnight. As a result people from all walks of life wanted to get there as quickly as possible. Some were prepared to pay \$90 for passage to California. Though it was described as the cheapest and easiest way to travel it was dangerous, as it involved a journey around South America. However, the lure of gold was so great that people took the risk. They believed that they would make their fortunes in California.

Question 2 (c)

Target:	Recognition and explanation of historical interpretations; analysis of key historical features; quality of written communication		
Mark allocation:	AO1	AO2	AO3
10	2	2	6

Question: **One interpretation is that the roles of men and women in Indian society were completely separate. How far do you agree with this interpretation?** [10]

Use 0 for incorrect or irrelevant answers.

LEVEL 1 Generalised answer; makes simple comments about the interpretation; will copy or paraphrase the given evidence. [1-2]

Eg: Indian women did have different roles from the men. Men were responsible for hunting and protecting the tribe. Women were responsible for the home and family.

LEVEL 2 Identifies differences between ways in which the issue has been interpreted; will offer a basic judgement with some support from given evidence and own knowledge of the issue. [3-5]

Eg: Answers will show understanding of the named interpretation that men and women did have different roles. Expect basic contextual support to be given in terms of a judgement.

Evidence 1, the modern Indian historian, states that men and women had separate roles. Men provided food for and protected the tribe, women cared for the home. This view is supported by the traveller (Evidence 3) who stated that women unloaded the tipis and prepared the camp, while the men prepared for the hunt. Not everyone agreed with this. The writer of the Evidence 2. states that, in Apache society, women were as warlike as the men. This suggests that there was no difference in their roles.

LEVEL 3 Begins to recognise and comment on how and why this issue has been interpreted in different ways; will give a judgement regarding the given interpretation. [6-8]

Eg: Answers will address the question by offering comment on different interpretations of the roles of men and women in Indian society. Answers will begin to demonstrate why different interpretations of this issue have been made.

One interpretation is that men and women had different roles. The modern Indian historian (Evidence 1) takes this view. He/she clearly states that women were responsible for the home and family, while men hunted for food and protected the tribe. He/she should know how Indian society functioned. In Evidence 3 the traveller supports this view. He describes how, while the men discussed the hunt, the women took care of the camp and dispensed hospitality. He is giving us a first-hand account of his own experiences in 1866, while he was living among the Sioux. He gives a description of the roles of men and women which is a traditional one. Evidence 2 gives an alternative interpretation. The writer is an ex-army officer who fought against the Apaches, and this may explain his views. He states that among the Apache women were as warlike as the men and also went into battle. He is writing about a different tribe who may have had different traditions from the Sioux, who the other sources describe.

LEVEL 4 **Recognises and provides substantiated comments on how and why this issue has been interpreted in different ways; will give a clear judgement considering the given interpretation in the historical context.**
[9-10]

Eg: Answers will clearly state whether they agree with the given interpretation. In order to make this judgement, answers will discuss how the given interpretation has been arrived at and recognise that there are other valid interpretations of this issue. In Evidence 1 we have evidence from a present-day native American historian, who should have a good knowledge of his/her own culture, both through research and via the oral history of the tribe. It states clearly that men and women had different roles. Men were responsible for hunting and protecting the tribe. Women were responsible for home and family. Their status was high as they owned the tipi they lived in. Evidence 3 tends to support this view. The writer explains how the men sat around to discuss the hunt, while the women put up the tipis and then provided hospitality. Though he spent only a short time among the Indians his account is valuable as it is a straightforward diary observation. He also seems focused on the daily life of the Indian. The fact that he knows how to get food when hungry (sit down in the centre of the tipi) suggests that he has some knowledge of Sioux society. Evidence 2 gives a different perspective. The writer implies that, among the Apache, there was no difference between men and women, with the women being equally warlike. However, his experiences of the Apache were from a soldier's point of view. He may not have visited an Apache camp and seen them in a day to day situation. He is also writing a book which he will want to sell, so may exaggerate. The range of evidence given in parts 1 and 3 point to the conclusion that men and women did have different roles.

QUESTION 3

Question 3

Target:	Recall and deployment of knowledge; explanation and analysis of key concepts; quality of written communication			
Mark allocation:	AO1	AO2	AO3	SPG
15	4	8		3

Question: **Were improved communications the main reason for the later settlement of the Plains?** [12+3]

Use 0 for incorrect or irrelevant answers.

LEVEL 1 Generalised answer; basic response which offers little support. [1-3]

Eg. Improved communications were the main reason for the later settlement of the Plains. The railways meant that many people were able to travel west cheaply and easily. It was also quicker than wagon train.

LEVEL 2 Answer begins to discuss the issue set in the question. [4-6]

To distinguish between 4 and 6 marks apply the following:

For 4 marks: A one-sided answer with some contextual support **OR** a very weak two-sided answer with little contextual support.

For 5-6 marks: A developed one-sided answer with contextual support **OR** a weak two-sided answer with some contextual support. Award the higher mark for the degree of contextual support.

Eg. Improved communications were an important reason for the later settlement of the Plains. The building of the railways allowed thousands and thousands of settlers to head west cheaply and easily. They were also a lot safer and faster than wagon trains. The trans-continental telegraph was opened in 1861. It also meant that information could be transmitted in a matter of hours. In the years after the civil war there were other reasons why settlers headed west on to the Plains. Land was cheap and plentiful and advertised by both the government and railway companies. Many people also wanted a new start in life and moved on to the Plains for the freedom it gave them.

LEVEL 3 **Answer is mainly a reasoned analysis of the issue set in the question.**
[7-9]

To distinguish between 7 and 9 marks apply the following:

For 7 marks: A very good one-sided answer with contextual support **OR** an unbalanced two-sided response with contextual support.

For 8-9 marks: A reasoned and developed analysis of the issue but lacking some detail or balance. Award the higher mark for the degree of contextual support.

Eg: Answers will begin to offer a judgement with good reasoning.

On the one hand, improvements in communications were an important reason. Railways created access to the Plains for hundreds of thousands of settlers. They were cheap, safe and reliable. The railway companies also owned land which was advertised at reasonable prices to settler families. The completion of the transcontinental telegraph in 1861 also helped as messages could be relayed quickly across the West.

However, improved communications were not the only reasons why many people moved on to the Plains. The US government began to encourage settlement of the Plains through the Homestead Act (1862) which gave 160 acres of land to each family. The government also began to pacify the Plains by reducing the threat from the Indians. Indian tribes were forced on to reservations to control them. The army also built forts for the same reason. Their job was made easier by the fact that men and supplies could be sent quickly by rail and messages by telegraph. The presence of the army also encouraged settlers to take up the offer of cheap land made by both the government and railway companies. After the Civil War many people headed west to start a new life. Some simply wanted freedom, others hoped to make their fortunes e.g. by ranching or mining.

Level 4

Answer is a developed, reasoned and well-substantiated analysis of the issue set in the question. [10-12]

To distinguish between 10 and 12 marks apply the following:

For 10 marks: A developed, reasoned and well-substantiated analysis with good balance, using mostly accurate and relevant contextual support.

For 11-12 marks: A developed, reasoned and well-substantiated analysis with good balance, using fully accurate and relevant contextual support. Award the higher mark for the degree of contextual support.

Eg: Improvements in communications was an important reason, but was only one among many. Improved communications certainly played a key role in helping hundreds of thousands of settlers head West. The railways were quicker, safer and more reliable than travel by wagon train and helped develop the economy of the Plains. They also carried the products of the Plains e.g. wheat, cattle and metals to the cities of the east. The creation of the transcontinental telegraph in 1861 also helped settle the Plains. It was used extensively, not only by the army, but also by businesses in the Plains. However, improved communications were not the only reason for the later settlement of the Plains. Security and fear of attacks by Indians had been a major reason that the plains had not been extensively settled before. After the end of the Civil War the government instructed the army to pacify the Plains tribes to make the Plains safe for settlers. The government wanted to develop the economy of the Plains. Troops were deployed west in larger numbers. The army also built forts and made use of the telegraph system. Under the Homestead Act (1862) the government offered 160 acres of free land to settler families. Later, the Timber Culture Act (1873) and the Desert Land Act (1877) also encouraged settlers. People who were unable to buy land in the east took advantage. The government also encouraged the exploitation of minerals e.g. gold from the Black Hills. Many pioneers settled for other reasons. The end of the Civil War saw some people heading to the plains in search of freedom and open spaces. Some were ex-soldiers, others were ex-slaves. They took work as cowboys, miners or homesteaders. These were supplemented by immigrants from Europe who were desperate to escape poverty and create a new life. Some groups, like the Mormons, had gone West to escape persecution in the 1840s. They continued to encourage settlers to Utah. Improved communications were a major reason, but there were others which were equally important. Many reasons were inter-related e.g. the railways moved settlers and troops west, but without the protection the army gave the railways would not have been built.

Examiners are expected to award marks for spelling, punctuation and the accurate use of grammar in this question.

Level	Performance descriptions
0	Candidates do not reach the threshold performance outlined in the performance description below.
<i>Threshold performance</i> 1 mark	Candidates spell, punctuate and use the rules of grammar with reasonable accuracy in the context of the demands of the question. Any errors do not hinder meaning in the response. Where required, they use a limited range of specialist terms appropriately.
<i>Intermediate performance</i> 2 marks	Candidates spell, punctuate and use the rules of grammar with considerable accuracy and general control of meaning in the context of the demands of the question. Where required, they use a good range of specialist terms with facility.
<i>High performance</i> 3 marks	Candidates spell, punctuate and use the rules of grammar with consistent accuracy and effective control of meaning in the context of the demands of the question. Where required, they use a wide range of specialist terms adeptly and with precision.