wjec cbac

GCE AS MARKING SCHEME

SUMMER 2019

```
AS (NEW)
LAW - UNIT 1
THE NATURE OF LAW AND THE WELSH AND
ENGLISH LEGAL SYSTEM
2150U10-1
```

INTRODUCTION

This marking scheme was used by WJEC for the 2019 examination. It was finalised after detailed discussion at examiners' conferences by all the examiners involved in the assessment. The conference was held shortly after the paper was taken so that reference could be made to the full range of candidates' responses, with photocopied scripts forming the basis of discussion. The aim of the conference was to ensure that the marking scheme was interpreted and applied in the same way by all examiners.

It is hoped that this information will be of assistance to centres but it is recognised at the same time that, without the benefit of participation in the examiners' conference, teachers may have different views on certain matters of detail or interpretation.

WJEC regrets that it cannot enter into any discussion or correspondence about this marking scheme.

WJEC GCE AS LAW

UNIT 1: THE NATURE OF LAW AND THE WELSH AND ENGLISH LEGAL SYSTEM

SUMMER 2019 MARK SCHEME

Marking guidance for examiners

Summary of assessment objectives for Unit 1

The questions in Section A and Section B assess all three assessment objectives - AO1, AO2 and AO3. The assessment objectives focus on the ability to demonstrate knowledge and understanding of legal rules and principles; the ability to apply legal rules and principles to given scenarios in order to present a legal argument using appropriate terminology, and the ability to analyse and evaluate legal rules, principles, concepts and issues.

The structure of the mark scheme

The mark scheme for both Section A and Section B has two parts:

- indicative content which can be used to assess the quality of the specific response. The content is not prescriptive and candidates are not expected to mention all the material referred to. Examiners should seek to credit any further admissible evidence offered by the candidates.
- an assessment grid advising bands and associated marks that should be allocated to responses which demonstrate the characteristics needed in AO1, AO2 and AO3.

Stage 1 - Deciding on the band

Beginning at the lowest band, examiners should look at the learner's answer and check whether it matches the descriptor for that band. If the descriptor at the lowest band is satisfied, examiners should move up to the next band and repeat this process for each band until the descriptor matches the answer.

If an answer covers different aspects of different bands within the mark scheme, a 'best fit' approach should be adopted to decide on the band and then the learner's response should be used to decide on the mark within the band. For instance if a response is mainly in band 2 but with a limited amount of band 3 content, the answer would be placed in band 2, but the mark awarded would be close to the top of band 2 as a result of the band 3 content.

Examiners should not seek to mark candidates down as a result of small omissions in minor areas of an answer.

- The first stage for an examiner is to use both the indicative content and the assessment grid to decide the overall band.
- The second stage is to decide how firmly the characteristics expected for that band are displayed.
- Thirdly, a mark for the question is awarded.

Stage 2 - Deciding on the mark

During standardising (marking conference), detailed advice from the Principal Examiner on the qualities of each mark band will be given. Examiners will then receive examples of answers in each mark band that have been awarded a mark by the Principal Examiner.

Examiners should mark the examples and compare their marks with those of the Principal Examiner.

When marking, examiners can use these examples to decide whether a learner's response is of a superior, inferior or comparable standard to the example. Examiners are reminded of the need to revisit the answer as they apply the mark scheme in order to confirm that the band and the mark allocated is appropriate to the response provided.

Indicative content is also provided for banded mark schemes. Indicative content is not exhaustive, and any other valid points must be credited. In order to reach the highest bands of the mark scheme a learner need not cover all of the points mentioned in the indicative content but must meet the requirements of the highest mark band. Where a response is not creditworthy, that is contains nothing of any significance to the mark scheme, or where no response has been provided, no marks should be awarded.

Section A

1. Explain the Rule of Law doctrine.

Indicative content

NOTE: The content is not prescriptive and candidates are not expected to mention all the material mentioned below. Each answer will be assessed on its merits according to the assessment grid and the indicative content. Examiners should seek to credit any further admissible evidence offered by candidates.

In explaining what is meant by the rule of law, candidates are expected to demonstrate knowledge and understanding of legal rules and principles underlying the rule of law. In demonstrating this knowledge and understanding, candidates are required to focus on the specific nature of the question and not simply give a general answer on law making.

- The Constitutional Reform Act 2005.
- The separation of powers.
- The centrality of Dicey and the concept of the Rule of Law as a buttress against arbitrary power.
- Reference to other theorists, e.g. Raz.
- Examples of breaches of the rule of law e.g. extraordinary rendition
- Relevant citation e.g. A & Others v The Home Office (2004).

Band	Marks	AO1: Demonstrate knowledge and understanding of legal rules and principles	
4	9 - 10	 Excellent, detailed knowledge and understanding of legal rules and principles relating to the rule of law. 	
3	6 - 8	 Good knowledge and understanding of legal rules and principles relating to the rule of law. 	
2	3 - 5	 Satisfactory knowledge and understanding of legal rules and principles relating to the rule of law. 	
1	1 - 2	 Basic knowledge and understanding of legal rules and principles relating to the rule of law. 	
	0	Response not creditworthy or not attempted.	

2. Explain the techniques used by judges to avoid an awkward precedent.

Indicative content

NOTE: The content is not prescriptive and candidates are not expected to mention all the material mentioned below. Each answer will be assessed on its merits according to the assessment grid and the indicative content. Examiners should seek to credit any further admissible evidence offered by candidates.

[10]

In explaining what is meant by the techniques used to avoid an awkward precedent candidates are expected to demonstrate knowledge and understanding of the English legal system and legal rules and principles underlying judicial precedent. In demonstrating this knowledge and understanding candidates are required to focus on the specific nature of the question and not simply give a general answer on precedent.

- an explanation of overruling, reversing and distinguishing
- relationship of the court hierarchy in relation to precedent
- relevant case examples to illustrate the operation of overruling, reversing and distinguishing

Band	Marks	AO1: Demonstrate knowledge and understanding of legal rules and principles	
4	9 - 10	 Excellent, detailed knowledge and understanding of legal rules and principles relating to techniques used by judges to avoid awkward precedents. 	
3	6 - 8	 Good knowledge and understanding of legal rules and principles relating to techniques used by judges to avoid awkward precedents. 	
2	3 - 5	 Satisfactory knowledge and understanding of legal rules and principles relating to techniques used by judges to avoid awkward precedents. 	
1	1 - 2	 Basic knowledge and understanding of legal rules and principles relating to techniques used by judges to avoid awkward precedents. 	
	0	Response not creditworthy or not attempted.	

3. Read the scenario below, and answer the question that follows.

Mark was recently involved in an accident with a driver who dropped the cigarette he was smoking whilst driving his car. Sadly, Mark's son died in the accident. Unlike using a mobile phone whilst driving, there is no specific offence for smoking whilst driving, though it can be covered by reckless driving. Mark would like to see a specific offence introduced and has asked your advice on the ways in which he could influence this change in the law.

Using your knowledge of the influences on Parliament, advise Mark as to the methods he could use to try to influence Parliament to change the law. [28]

Indicative content

NOTE: The content is not prescriptive and candidates are not expected to mention all the material mentioned below. Each answer will be assessed on its merits according to the assessment grid and the indicative content. Examiners should seek to credit any further admissible evidence offered by candidates.

In advising Mark candidates are expected to demonstrate knowledge and understanding of the influences on Parliament. Candidates are expected to apply the full range of legal rules and principles that affect the influences on Parliament in changing the law. In this case candidates may apply both the effects of pressure groups and interest groups to the given scenario in order to present a legal argument, using appropriate legal terminology.

- advising Mark that he could set up a pressure group to bring about reform of the law; there may be reference to the success of other groups that have specific interests or causes, such as the Law Society, Greenpeace, Fathers 4 Justice, Amnesty International
- advising Mark of the role that Parliament and his MP can play in reforming the law : the majority of law reform is carried out by Parliament through repealing, creating, consolidating and codifying. This may be in pursuit of party political agendas or may be the outcome of a Private Member's Bill on smoking whilst driving
- advising Mark that, with regard to judicial change, judges can reform the law on smoking whilst driving through the creation of original precedent and Mark may wish to begin a legal action. This is not common as judges need to be mindful of their constitutional position. Notable examples include the cases of Diane Pretty, Debbie Purdy and Daniel James
- members of the public such as Mark can sometimes bring about law reform by using the media as a vehicle. Notable examples include the Dangerous Dogs Act 1991
- if a newspaper gets behind Mark's campaign of law reform, this can be very successful to gain Parliament's attention; for example, the passing of 'Sarah's Law' which came about as a result of a campaign by the News of the World calling for the public to have access to the sex offender's register
- a successful campaign by Mark may help to establish the setting up of a Royal Commission.

Band	Marks	AO1: Demonstrate knowledge and understanding of legal rules and principles	
4	4	• Excellent, detailed knowledge and understanding of the influences on Parliament.	
3	3	 Good knowledge and understanding of the influences on Parliament 	
2	2	 Satisfactory knowledge and understanding of influences on Parliament 	
1	1	 Basic knowledge and understanding of the influences on Parliament 	
	0	Response not creditworthy or not attempted.	

Band	Marks	AO2: Apply legal rules and principles to given scenarios in order to present a legal argument using appropriate legal terminology	
4	18 - 24	 Excellent, detailed application of legal rules and principles to Mark's situation. Excellent presentation of a legal argument, using appropriate legal terminology, case law and other legal authorities relating to the ways in which Parliament can be influenced to change the law. 	
3	12 - 17	 Good application of legal rules and principles to Mark's situation. Good presentation of a legal argument using appropriate legal terminology, case law and other legal authorities relating to the ways in which Parliament can be influenced to change the law. 	
2	7 - 11	 Satisfactory application of legal rules and principles to Mark's situation. Satisfactory presentation of a legal argument, using some appropriate legal terminology, case law and other legal authorities relating to the ways in which Parliament can be influenced to change the law. 	
1	1 - 6	 Basic application of legal rules and principles to Mark's situation. Basic presentation of a legal argument, using minimal legal terminology relating to the ways in which Parliament can be influenced to change the law. 	
	0	Response not creditworthy or not attempted.	

4. Read the fictitious statute and the scenario below, and answer the question that follows.

Following concerns raised in Parliament about the importation of some wildlife products from countries where those species are endangered, Parliament passed the Protection of Endangered Species (Fictitious) Act 2017.

Section 1 of the Act makes it an offence for 'any person to knowingly be in possession in the United Kingdom of any wildlife product that has been imported into the United Kingdom unless he has possession of a sales licence.'

Section 2 makes it an offence for any person to 'import or seek to import into the United Kingdom any wildlife product unless he has an import licence.'

Derek owns a shop in which he sells artefacts from abroad. His premises are raided by police officers and several products are seized. The products seized are found to contain fur from an endangered Brazilian monkey, which is a protected species under the Act. Derek is charged under Section 1. Derek has no sales license but claims that he did not know that the products contained this fur, however, the customs officials note that the accompanying papers written in Portuguese refer to the fur. Derek does not read or speak Portuguese. Derek used a trader called Ronaldo, based in London to import the products from Brazil.

Using the rules of statutory interpretation, advise Derek and Ronaldo as to whether any offences have been committed in this situation. [2

[28]

Indicative content

NOTE: The content is not prescriptive and candidates are not expected to mention all the material mentioned below. Each answer will be assessed on its merits according to the assessment grid and the indicative content. Examiners should seek to credit any further admissible evidence offered by candidates.

In advising Derek and Ronaldo candidates are expected to demonstrate knowledge and understanding of statutory interpretation. Candidates are expected to apply the full range of legal rules and principles that affect the application of the rules of statutory interpretation to Derek and Ronaldo's situation. In this case candidates may apply the literal, golden, mischief and purposive rules, plus other aids of interpretation, including both intrinsic and extrinsic aids, to the given scenario in order to present a legal argument, using appropriate legal terminology.

- Applying the four rules of statutory interpretation to the scenario:
 - Literal: gives words the natural and grammatical meaning, even if the result is absurd – Whitely v Chappel, Lees v Secretary of State, Fisher v Bell, London LNER v Berriman. Application of the rule to the scenario: for instance, would a group of holiday makers be classed as local inhabitants? Was the party in the open air?
 - Golden: allows words in a statute to be modified in order to avoid an absurdity or repugnant result – Sweet v Parsley, Adler v George, Re Sigsworth, R v Allen. Application of the rule to the scenario: for instance, are there any absurdities or repugnancies when the statute is interpreted?
 - Mischief: looks at the gap in the law Parliament intended to fill. Established in Heydon's Case. Used in Smith v Hughes, Royal College of Nursing v DHSS, Pepper v Hart. Application of the rule to the scenario: for instance, how would the Act be interpreted if it was introduced with the purpose of filling a gap in the Common Law?

- Purposive: looks at the 'spirit of the law' and looks to see what Parliament intended, favoured approach of interpretation of EU Law Magor v St Mellons, Quinataville, Jones v Tower Boot Company.
 Application of the approach to the scenario: for instance, are there any indications as to the intention of Parliament?
- Applying other methods of interpretation:
 - Intrinsic aids (short title, long title, preamble interpretation sections, margin notes, Rules of Language)
 - Extrinsic aids (Hansard, dictionaries, textbooks, Human Rights Act 1998, international conventions)
 - Presumptions

Band	Marks	AO1: Demonstrate knowledge and understanding of legal rules and principles	
4	4	• Excellent, detailed knowledge and understanding of statutory interpretation.	
3	3	Good knowledge and understanding of statutory interpretation.	
2	2	Satisfactory knowledge and understanding of statutory interpretation.	
1	1	Basic knowledge and understanding of statutory interpretation.	
	0	Response not creditworthy or not attempted.	

Band	Marks	AO2: Apply legal rules and principles to given scenarios in order to present a legal argument using appropriate legal terminology	
4	18 - 24	 Excellent, detailed application of legal rules and principles to Derek and Ronaldo's situation. Excellent presentation of a legal argument, using appropriate legal terminology, case law and other legal authorities relating to the rules of statutory interpretation. 	
3	12 - 17	 Good application of legal rules and principles to Derek and Ronaldo's situation. Good presentation of a legal argument, using appropriate legal terminology, case law and other legal authorities relating to the rules of statutory interpretation. 	
2	7 - 11	 Satisfactory application of legal rules and principles to Derek and Ronaldo's situation. Satisfactory presentation of a legal argument, using some appropriate legal terminology, case law and other legal authorities relating to the rules of statutory interpretation. 	
1	1 - 6	 Basic application of legal rules and principles to Derek and Ronaldo's situation. Basic presentation of a legal argument, using minimal legal terminology, relating to the rules of statutory interpretation. 	
	0	Response not creditworthy or not attempted.	

Section B

[8]

5. (a) Explain how magistrates are appointed.

Indicative content

NOTE: The content is not prescriptive and candidates are not expected to mention all the material mentioned below. Each answer will be assessed on its merits according to the assessment grid and the indicative content. Examiners should seek to credit any further admissible evidence offered by candidates.

In explaining how magistrates are appointed, candidates are expected to demonstrate knowledge and understanding of legal rules and principles underlying the selection and appointment of magistrates, including the role played by the Local Advisory Committees in this process. In demonstrating this knowledge and understanding, candidates are required to be aware of the procedure for appointing magistrates.

- as part of the appointment process, potential magistrates go through a selection process; this involves an interview by a local advisory committee
- in determining appointment the committee will consider the key (personal) qualities laid down by the Lord Chancellor
- to be appointed as a magistrate, applicants must meet certain qualifications including age, living / working within area (no longer a requirement to live within a 15 mile radius of the Bench on which they will serve)
- appointment is also based on several other factors including balance and requirements of bench, recommendation to Minister of Justice by Local Advisory Committee, background checks, formal appointment by Lord Chancellor

Band	Marks	AO1: Demonstrate knowledge and understanding of legal rules and principles	
3	6 - 8	• Excellent, detailed knowledge and understanding of legal rules and principles relating to how magistrates are appointed.	
2	3 - 5	 Good knowledge and understanding of legal rules and principles relating to how magistrates are appointed. 	
1	1 - 2	 Basic knowledge and understanding of legal rules and principles relating to how magistrates are appointed. 	
	0	Response not creditworthy or not attempted.	

5. (b) Analyse and evaluate whether the jury is representative of society in Wales and England.

Indicative content

NOTE: The content is not prescriptive and candidates are not expected to mention all the material mentioned below. Each answer will be assessed on its merits according to the assessment grid and the indicative content. Examiners should seek to credit any further admissible evidence offered by candidates.

Candidates will offer an analysis and evaluation of the legal rules, principles concepts and issues in order to analyse and evaluate whether the jury is representative of society. In order to analyse and evaluate these aspects, candidates must understand that trial by jury is a feature of the Welsh and English legal system but is not without criticism. Overall candidates will offer a debate and come to a substantiated judgement regarding whether the jury is representative of society in the justice system of Wales and England.

- Trial by jury mentioned in Magna Carta
- Juries Act 1974, selection process and jury representation strengthened by increasing those eligible – Criminal Justice Act 2003. However, cases such as *R v Abdroikof* and *R v Khan* question whether this increased eligibility (police officers, CPS, judges) is appropriate
- Candidates are summoned at random though much depends upon where they live as the electoral role is used as part of this process
- Eligibility discussion and candidates will be rewarded for accurate and appropriate citation
- Effects on jury representation by jury vetting with relevant citation
- Effects on jury representation by challenging challenging for cause and stand by
- Effects of judge alone trials on jury representation as introduced by the CJA 2003; R v Twomey
- No requirement for a racially balanced jury e.g. R v Ford
- Discussion of reforms that could improve how representative the jury is of society e.g. choose names from National insurance number register ; lower the eligibility age to 16

Band	Marks	AO3: Analyse and evaluate legal rules, principles, concepts and issues	
4	18 - 24	 Excellent, detailed analysis of legal rules, principles, concepts and issues relevant to whether the jury is representative of society in Wales and England. Excellent evaluation of whether the jury is representative of society in Wales and England, including a valid and substantiated judgement. Excellent use of supporting case law and legal authorities. 	
3	12 - 17	 Good analysis of legal rules, principles, concepts and issues relevant to whether the jury is representative of society in Wales and England. Good evaluation whether the jury is representative of society in Wales and England, including reference to a judgement. Good use of supporting case law and legal authorities. 	
2	7 - 11	 Satisfactory analysis of legal rules, principles, concepts and issues relevant to whether the jury is representative of society in Wales and England. Satisfactory evaluation of the reliability of whether the jury is representative of society in Wales and England, including reference to a judgement. Satisfactory use of supporting case law and legal authorities. 	
1	1 - 6	 Basic analysis of legal rules, principles, concepts and issues relevant to whether the jury is representative of society in Wales and England. Basic evaluation whether the jury is representative of society in Wales and England. Basic use of supporting case law and legal authorities. 	
	0	Response not creditworthy or not attempted.	

6. (a) Explain the sources of funding available to access justice in Wales and England.

[8]

Indicative content

NOTE: The content is not prescriptive and candidates are not expected to mention all the material mentioned below. Each answer will be assessed on its merits according to the assessment grid and the indicative content. Examiners should seek to credit any further admissible evidence offered by candidates.

In explaining the different sources of funding in Wales and England, candidates are expected to demonstrate knowledge and understanding of legal rules and principles underlying access to justice and funding. In demonstrating this knowledge and understanding, candidates are required to give an answer which is focused on the different sources of funding not on access to justice in general.

- Role of the Legal Aid Agency and the means test including, for example the challenges in respect of criminal legal aid
- Civil and Criminal Legal Aid
- The various advice schemes
- Alternative methods of funding
- Conditional fee arrangements

Band	Marks	AO1: Demonstrate knowledge and understanding of legal rules and principles	
3	6 - 8	• Excellent, detailed knowledge and understanding of the legal rules and principles relevant to the different sources of funding in Wales and England.	
2	3 - 5	 Good knowledge and understanding of the legal rules and principles relevant to the different sources of funding in Wales and England. 	
1	1 - 2	 Basic knowledge and understanding of the legal rules and principles relevant to the different sources of funding in Wales and England. 	
	0	Response not creditworthy or not attempted.	

6. (b) Analyse and evaluate the importance of conditional fee agreements. [24]

Indicative content

NOTE: The content is not prescriptive and candidates are not expected to mention all the material mentioned below. Each answer will be assessed on its merits according to the assessment grid and the indicative content. Examiners should seek to credit any further admissible evidence offered by candidates.

Candidates will offer an analysis and evaluation of the legal rules, principles, concepts and issues in order to evaluate the importance of conditional fee agreements. In order to analyse and evaluate these issues, candidates may argue that conditional fee agreements have widened access to justice and have contributed to lessening the problems with unmet legal need. Candidates might consider challenging this by arguing the range of key issues and concerns with conditional fee agreements, such as the uplift fee and the unavailability of these arrangements for certain areas of civil law. Overall candidates will offer a debate and come to a substantiated judgement regarding the importance of conditional fee agreements.

- the unmet need for legal services litigants cannot afford their own legal fees because of the tight civil legal aid budget. 'No win, no fee' arrangements are important because they offer an alternative for those who would not otherwise have access to justice as per Dicey's Rule of Law – everyone is equal before the law
- the background legal context including the Courts and Legal Services Act 1990 which introduced the concept of conditional fee arrangements
- the Access to Justice Act 1999 which introduced concept of uplift fee and success fees
- the Legal Aid, Sentencing and Punishment of Offenders Act 2012 success fee is no longer recoverable by losing party, limited categories of cases eligible for civil legal aid. Under this Act there are now two types of 'no win no fee' agreements: Conditional Fee Arrangements, and Damages Based Agreements. Both of these are important because they give litigants alternatives to court and reduce the number of litigants in person
- access to justice to those who cannot otherwise afford it; abolition of success fee
- pressure to settle out of court is this a "second best" resolution; lawyers will not take on high risk cases; pressure from insurance companies; winning litigants will be left with hardly any damages after paying fees
- considerations of law and justice include the meaning of 'justice' and the extent to which 'no win no fee' arrangements achieve justice or create barriers to justice. There can be different strengths between a claimant and a defendant and, without help for financially weaker parties, justice might not be achieved.

Band	Marks	AO3: Analyse and evaluate legal rules, principles, concepts and issues
4	18 - 24	 Excellent, detailed analysis of legal rules, principles, concepts and issues relevant to the importance of conditional fee arrangements. Excellent evaluation of the importance of conditional fee arrangements, including a valid and substantiated judgement. Excellent use of supporting case law and legal authorities.
3	12 - 17	 Good analysis of legal rules, principles, concepts and issues relevant to the importance of conditional fee arrangements. Good evaluation of to the importance of conditional fee arrangements, including reference to a judgement. Good use of supporting case law and legal authorities.
2	7 - 11	 Satisfactory analysis of legal rules, principles, concepts and issues relevant to the importance of conditional fee arrangements. Satisfactory evaluation of the importance of conditional fee arrangements, including reference to a judgement. Satisfactory use of supporting case law and legal authorities.
1	1 - 6	 Basic analysis of legal rules, principles, concepts and issues relevant to the importance of conditional fee arrangements. Basic evaluation of to the importance of conditional fee arrangements. Basic use of supporting case law and legal authorities.
	0	Response not creditworthy or not attempted.

WJEC AS (NEW) LAW - UNIT 1 2150U10-1 THE NATURE OF LAW AND THE WELSH AND ENGLISH LEGAL SYSTEM SUMMER 2019 MS/ED